

ON NIGERIA 2.0

CASE STUDY 1: INVESTIGATIVE REPORTING CHANGE STORIES

Evaluation and Learning Partner Team:

Randi Rumbold, 'Sumbo Oladipo, Michael Moses, Lynne Franco, Millicent Gyan, Olufunke Opadokun

Contact:

Michael Moses
Monitoring, Evaluation, and Learning Advisor
mmoses@encompassworld.com

EnCompass LLC 1100 Wayne Ave #1200 Silver Spring, MD 20910 Tel: +1 301-287-8700



Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARYi	i
Background i Overview of Cases i Findings ii Conclusions ii	ii ii
INTRODUCTION	L
METHODOLOGY	L
CASE 1: HUMANITARIAN JOURNALISM IN ACTION: HUMANGLE'S WORK WITH THE KNIFAR MOVEMENT	3
CASE 2: CONNECTING REPORTING TO ENGAGEMENT: CNJF, PRIMORG, AND DATA-DRIVEN COLLABORATION TO AMPLIFY AND ADDRESS LABOR ABUSES IN OGUN STATE	5
CASE 3: POWER IN PARTNERSHIP—FREEDOM RADIO, WAMAC, AND LEVERAGING LOCAL RADIO TO DRIVE ACTION ON STOLEN FUNDS AT ALIKO DANGOTE UNIVERSITY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY?	
FINDINGS9)
CONCLUSIONS	5

Executive Summary

Background

The MacArthur Foundation's Big Bet On Nigeria program aims to combat corruption by supporting local initiatives focused on accountability, transparency, and civic participation, including through investigative reporting and amplification. This report explores and synthesizes evidence from three Media and Journalism grantee partners' investigative reporting efforts. To develop this learning product, the EnCompass team started from an initial sample of 36 change stories shared by grantee partners, then applied a version of the Most Significant Change (MSC) methodology to lead the participatory selection of three investigative reporting cases for further analysis. Data for this report comes from key informant interviews (KIIs) with seven respondents (across three cases), as well as transcripts from grantee radio broadcasts and relevant news articles.

Overview

Snapshot of sampled cases representing grantees' investigative journalism efforts

Case and grantee	States	Actors represented	Activities by grantees and partners
Case 1: Humanitarian Journalism in Action: HumAngle's work with the Knifar Movement		Amnesty International Knifar Movement	Conducted humanitarian journalism efforts on wrongful detention of Boko Haram members and their families in poorly run internally displaced persons (IDP) camps.
HumAngle (Human Angle)	Borno	Doctors Without Borders International Committee of the Red Cross	Investigative reporting used relationship- building and capacity improvement, and story amplification used multimedia platforms, radio syndication, and policy brief dissemination.
Case 2: Connecting Reporting to Engagement: CNJF, PRIMORG, and data- driven collaboration to amplify and address labor abuses in Ogun State Cable Newspaper Journalism Foundation (CNJF); Progressive Impact Organization for Community Development (PRIMORG)	Ogun	The National Human Rights Commission (NHRC) Other ON 2.0 grantees and non- grantee media groups such as Leadership, TheNewsGuru, and Prima	Supported an investigation uncovering labor abuses at Ding XIng quarry. CNJF partnered with PRIMORG to amplify the story through a radio program, social media releases, and combined complaints submitted to relevant authorities on behalf of the workers.
Case 3: Power in Partnership: Freedom Radio, WAMAC, and leveraging local radio to drive action on stolen funds at Aliko Dangote	Kano	Freedom Radio Other local radio stations like Solar Space, Radio Rahama, and Express Radio	Investigated financial and management challenges at Aliko Dangote University of Science and Technology (ADUSTECH) in Wudil, Kano, through a partnership of radio station and university staff to uncover alleged fund theft by the Vice Chancellor. Amplification took place through radio broadcasts and a townhall

Case and	States	Actors represented	Activities by grantees and partners
grantee			
University of Science and	-	Academic Staff Union	hosted by Freedom Radio in collaboration
Technology		of Universities (ASUU)	with local CSOs.
Wadata Media and			
Advocacy Centre			
(WAMAĆ)			

Findings

Table 1 summarizes cross-case findings from this study.

Table 1. Summary of cross-case findings

Progress and Gaps against the On Nigeria Theory of Change

- #1 Grantee partner-supported investigations and amplification efforts have **improved awareness of and engagement on corruption and human rights abuses** in target communities.
- #2 Investigative reporting and amplification efforts contributed to **preliminary responses by government officials,** though actions against perpetrators of corruption and changes in policy to prevent corruption are less evident.
- #3 Grantee partner-supported investigative reporting and amplification efforts are contributing to improvements in citizens' awareness of and capacity to use accountability mechanisms, though questions about sustainability remain.

Factors that Facilitate and Challenge Investigative Reporting and Amplification Results

- #4 Bringing together reform-minded stakeholders across the media ecosystem to collaborate on strategic investigative reporting and amplification efforts deepens engagement, supports dissemination, and generates pressure for action.
- #5 Despite concern about and disapproval of corruption, public officials and citizens are sometimes unwilling to support or engage in anticorruption reporting.

Conclusions

Three key conclusions emerge from these cases (Table 2).

Table 2. Cross-case conclusions

- #1 The evidence in these cases suggests that grantees' approaches to investigative reporting and amplification have **improved citizens' awareness** of corruption and abuses in local contexts, supported **broader participation in efforts to pressure government actors** to take action, and contributed **to modest improvements in the conditions of those affected by exploitation.**
- **#2** Despite preliminary signs of progress, **sustained improvements in transparency remain limited**, and full accountability for those accused of corruption and other abuses is lacking. These deficits have many causes, but **citizen disaffection and resourcing challenges for media organizations** are important factors.
- **#3** Grantees and their partners involved in these change stories are leveraging collaborative investigative reporting and amplification efforts to seek **improvements in sectors beyond the accountability ecosystem**, including education and human rights.

Introduction

The MacArthur Foundation's Big Bet On Nigeria program supports Nigerian-led efforts to reduce corruption by strengthening accountability, transparency, and participation. The Media and Journalism cohort produces and disseminates corruption-related investigative journalism, works with civil society to amplify stories to increase citizens' awareness of corruption and encourage

citizen and government action on anticorruption and accountability efforts, and trains the next generation of journalists and media outlets.

This case study report explores Learning Question 1.4 from the On Nigeria 2.0 Evaluation and Learning Framework and Learning Priorities 1 and 2 (see box). This study analyzes how grantees engage in and support investigative reporting on corruption, how those efforts contribute to action and reform, and under what conditions.

The report first provides a snapshot of three cases—examples of grantee partner-supported investigative reporting efforts—and then presents cross-case findings. The evidence in these cases

Learning Questions

1.4 How do grantee strategies most effectively amplify investigative reporting and encourage voice and teeth actors to take action against corruption?

Learning Priorities

- 1. How does the work done under On Nigeria, and with respect to the accountability ecosystem, contribute to outcomes in other areas and sectors?
- 2. How do grantees come together to address other topics, beyond anticorruption, in the broader accountability ecosystem?

suggests that Media and Journalism grantees are publishing and amplifying investigative reports in ways that contribute to increased awareness of and engagement around both corruption and exploitation in other sectors, as well as preliminary actions by public officials. To sustain nascent transparency wins and achieve long-lasting accountability, however, complementary actions to shift social norms and additional resourcing for in-depth reporting and amplification efforts will be needed.

Methodology

Most Significant Change (MSC) is a participatory evaluation method that brings groups of people from various levels of a program together to explore stories in which their work has contributed to impactful results. EnCompass applied an adapted version of the MSC methodology to identify the three cases analyzed in this study. EnCompass began by assessing the 36 stories of change that Media and Journalism grantees and partners shared in *Learning Brief: Amplifying Investigative Reporting* (2022) against criteria that the On Nigeria Program

Criteria for Case Selection

- Clear connection to corruption
- Extent to which gender equality and social inclusion (GESI) elements or considerations are featured in the change story
- Extent of collaboration with other grantees or non-grantees
- The potential sustainability of the resulting change
- Whether there was any involvement of citizens

Team validated (see box). EnCompass engaged the Program Team and Media and Journalism grantees in story selection workshops to review the story sample.

With the support of the grantees involved, EnCompass then conducted a total of seven interviews (KIIs) to further explore each selected change story (Exhibit 1). EnCompass also harvested transcripts from grantee radio broadcasts and identified relevant news articles for additional review and analysis. The team coded, analyzed, integrated, and synthesized all collected data to produce the cases, overarching findings, and conclusions presented in this memo.

Exhibit 1. Respondent sample across cases

Case	# of KIIs	# of journalists or media organization respondents	# of amplification ¹ partner respondents	# of additional materials
Case 1: Humanitarian Journalism in Action: HumAngle's work with the Knifar Movement	2	2	0	4 HumAngle articles 1 podcast
Case 2: Connecting Reporting to Engagement: The Cable, Progressive Impact Organization for Community Development (PRIMORG), and data-driven collaboration to amplify and address labor abuses in Ogun State	3	2	1	1 episode of Public Conscience on Radio
Case 3: Power in Partnership—Freedom Radio, Wadata Media and Advocacy Centre (WAMAC), and leveraging local radio to drive action on stolen funds at Aliko Dangote University of Science and Technology (ADUSTECH)	2	2	0	7 news articles, various sources

This study confronted two limitations. First, the initial sample of 36 change stories in *Learning Brief:*Amplifying Investigative Reporting represented only seven Media and Journalism grantees. Though it made for a more efficient selection process, it potentially limited the breadth and representativeness of the stories that grantees and the Program Team could choose from during the selection process. Second, primary data collection proved unusually challenging, and the EnCompass team was not able to successfully interview all desired non-grantee respondents, with several government officials citing their inability to secure permission from supervisors. EnCompass sought to address potential evidence gaps by capturing data from published news articles, radio episodes, and podcasts, as described above.

¹ For the purposes of On Nigeria, "amplification" is defined as "Any activity intended to increase the reach of a report or issue and/or expose that report/issue to a broader audience."

Case 1: Humanitarian Journalism in Action: HumAngle's work with the Knifar Movement

Context and Background. Communities in North East Nigeria, particularly in Borno state, are plagued by Boko Haram. In 2013, the Nigerian army launched a campaign against the terror group. In many communities, the army began to indefinitely detain local men as suspected members of Boko Haram, without due process. At the same time, the military forcibly relocated many women to internally displaced persons (IDPs) camps severely lacking basic necessities and services. Thousands of men, women, and children reportedly died in such camps.² In 2016, a group of 2,000 women, with the support of Allamin Foundation for Peace and Development, organized the Knifar movement to demand the release of their husbands. In 2020, On Nigeria grantee HumAngle (Human Angle) took up reporting on the Knifar movement.

Exhibit 2. Case Snapshot: Humanitarian Journalism in Action: HumAngle's work with the Knifar Movement

Grantee: HumAngle (Human Angle)



BORNO STATE



Issue: The Nigerian army has kept thousands of suspected Boko Haram members in detention since 2013. Their wives and families are kept in poorly run IDP camps. The Knifar movement advocates for the release of their wrongfully detained husbands.

Activities: Since 2020, On Nigeria grantee HumAngle has engaged in humanitarian journalism to carry out an ongoing investigation into the issues affecting the Knifar women. HumAngle journalists have built relationships with the Knifar women, improved the capacity of some women to conduct interviews to tell their own stories, and amplified the story through multimedia platforms, syndication on various radio stations, and the dissemination of policy briefs.



ACTORS REPRESENTED

- **HumAngle (Human Angle):** HumAngle engages in humanitarian journalism around conflict and crisis in Nigeria and Africa to reduce human suffering and keep governments accountable. They began reporting on Knifar in 2020 and continue to publish reports today.
- Amnesty International: Amnesty International, a global human rights organization, connected HumAngle to the Knifar women in 2020.
- **Knifar Movement:** Created in 2016 with the support of the Allamin Foundation for Peace and Development, Knifar women have advocated for their husbands' release from IDP camps. The leadership works with HumAngle as sources, fixers, and journalists.
- Doctors Without Borders and the International Committee of the Red Cross support
 HumAngle's podcasting on these issues. Some local radio stations have also rebroadcast the
 podcasts.

² Based on HumAngle and Amnesty International Research. See, for example: https://humanglemedia.com/knifarwomen-facing-forced-family-separation-by-soldiers-cry-out/.

Investigative reporting process. The founder and CEO of HumAngle has been reporting on Boko Haram for more than 20 years. In 2020, Amnesty International connected HumAngle with the Knifar women. In the years since, HumAngle has reported on the wrongful detention of the men, what happened to the women and children in the IDP camps, and their struggle for survival, painting a vivid, personal picture of the human rights abuses and corruption they face daily.

...we focus on speaking from the perspective of the victims and that is why our name is called Human Angle, so the idea is for us to tell those stories from a human-centered lens, and I think by doing that, we quickly connected to the right people, and we are doing our best to contribute to solving those problems.

- Grantee KII 03

Trust has been essential to HumAngle's reporting. The founder of HumAngle speaks Hausa and is from North East Nigeria, which allowed him to work directly with the Knifar women. HumAngle journalists often partner with a local fixer and translator to speak with the women and have provided a few women with smartphones and trained them to conduct interviews themselves. These efforts have strengthened trust between HumAngle and the women, which has enabled the Knifar women to substantively contribute to HumAngle's reporting as sources, fixers, and by carrying out investigations themselves.

Amplification process. HumAngle continues to amplify this story in three major ways:

- 1) **Multimedia approach:** Publishing written reports, creating animated videos, interview videos, and featuring stories about the Knifar movement on three podcasts (Humanitarian Voices, Vestiges of Violence, and Birbishin Rikici, (Vestiges of Violence in Hausa).
- 2) **Syndication:** Syndicating reports in Premium Times and other news websites and podcasts on a local radio station in the Lake Chad region that broadcasts in Kanuri, Hausa, and Fulfude.
- 3) **Policy briefs:** Developing and sharing policy briefs with relevant stakeholders and policymakers.

Action. HumAngle believes that their engagement with the Knifar women improved their ability to engage in journalism and advocacy and could potentially strengthen accountability. They report that their work could also inspire other media organizations to undertake human-centered advocacy reporting, which could eventually lead to more accountability. HumAngle feels their other projects, specifically the On Nigeria-supported fellowship program, which builds the capacity of local reporters, also contribute to this aim.

Results Achieved. The Nigerian army has released many of the wrongfully detained men. The largest release of 1,009 men occurred between July and November 2021, one year after reporting began. There have been other smaller releases as well. Respondents involved with HumAngle's reporting acknowledged that there are additional changes they hope to see, including the release of information to track arrests, detainees, and their cases, as well as better treatment of both detainees and IDPs.

Case 2: Connecting Reporting to Engagement: CNJF, PRIMORG, and data-driven collaboration to amplify and address labor abuses in Ogun State

Context and Background. Ogun State, one of six states in the South West of Nigeria, is home to many quarries, several of which reportedly routinely engage in labor abuses. Such abuses include not paying the legally required minimum wage, not providing personal protective equipment (PPE), unsafe working conditions that cause injury, and failing to pay hazard allowances. In 2021, an independent journalist received a tip alleging the illegal and inhumane treatment of employees at a quarry run by Ding Xing, a Chinese-owned company. The journalist pitched the story to the Cable Newspaper Journalism Foundation (CNJF), an On Nigeria grantee, and began an investigation with their support.

Exhibit 3. Case Snapshot: Connecting Reporting to Engagement: CNJF, PRIMORG, and data-driven collaboration to amplify and address labor abuses in Ogun State

Grantees: CNJF & PRIMORG



OGUN STATE



Issue: Local and foreign-owned quarries are prevalent in Ogun state, and some have been found to treat their workers poorly. An independent journalist received a tip of labor abuses at Ding Xing quarry. With support from CNJF, the journalist launched an investigation. CNJF later collaborated with PRIMORG to amplify this report.

Activities: CNJF sponsored and published an undercover investigation into the alleged abuses at a quarry in Ogun state. PRIMORG amplified the report in several ways, including by broadcasting a radio program featuring a guest from the National Human Rights Commission, publishing press releases on multiple social media platforms to engage relevant government agencies and key stakeholders, and submitting combined complaints to responsible parties on behalf of workers at the quarry.



ACTORS REPRESENTED

- Cable Newspaper Journalism Foundation (CNJF): An On Nigeria grantee and sister
 organization of TheCable online newspaper, CNJF "uses the vehicle of journalism to advance
 transparency and accountability in government"³ and sponsored an independent journalist
 to go undercover to investigate the issues at the Ding Xing quarry in Ogun state. TheCable
 published the report in early 2022.
- Progressive Impact Organization for Community Development (PRIMORG): Another On Nigeria Grantee, PRIMORG works to strengthen anticorruption and accountability by amplifying corruption-related investigative reports on the radio and social media. PRIMORG featured TheCable's story on their radio program *Public Conscience on Radio*. They featured

³ See here: https://www.cablefoundation.org/who-we-are/.

guests from the National Human Rights Commission, Bingham University, and Care for Legal Assistance and Human Rights Protection on the program, sharing the investigative report with potential guests, and pushed TheCable's reporting on social media, including YouTube and WhatsApp, as well as Partners United.

- The National Human Rights Commission (NHRC): The NHRC, on receiving the report from PRIMORG, sent a representative who joined the radio program and made a commitment to further investigate the abuse allegations.
- Other Actors: Other grantees of The MacArthur Foundation and non-grantees such as Leadership, TheNewsGuru, and Prima helped to amplify the report through newspaper publications, online platforms, and other social media platforms.

Investigative reporting process. CNJF sponsors young graduates and journalists to report on stories related to good governance, and they provided a grant to an independent reporter who had received a tip regarding labor abuses at Ding Xing quarry in Ogun state. Posing as a motor boy, the reporter gained access to the quarry through a truck driver and got first-hand information on the activities inside, after which TheCable published his investigative report.

Amplification process. PRIMORG, which regularly reviews grantee news sites for reports to amplify, conducted the following amplification activities:

- 1) **Public Conscience on Radio:** This episode featured experts on labor issues, the reporter, and a representative from the NHRC. The NHRC representative committed to investigating the issues. The program was also posted on YouTube, with short clips posted to other social media platforms.
- 2) **Letter of Complaint:** Sent to the Nigerian Labour Congress and other government agencies, this letter requested further investigation into the allegations and included a copy of the report.
- 3) **Press Releases:** PRIMORG posted press releases to their own social media and sent them to other media outlets for publication, such as Leadership, TheNewsGuru, and Prima, and the Platform of the Partners United Against (PUAC) portal of the Yar'Adua Foundation.

Action. Respondents believe people in Ogun state and elsewhere are now more aware of labor abuses in quarries. For example, a lawyer reportedly reviewed quarry employees' labor contracts and engaged workers to improve their understanding of legally required working conditions, the NHRC committed to further investigate the alleged abuses, and the government sanctioned some quarries for unsafe working conditions.

Results Achieved. Due to the sanctions applied, workers in some of the quarries reportedly received PPE, and stakeholders hope workers and unions will achieve better working conditions in the future. Despite these outcomes, respondents described a need to improve citizens' awareness of their rights in addition to knowing how to submit complaints to the authorities. Respondents also described the government's actions as insufficient; sanctions were inadequate, victims received no compensation, and more generally, quarries are still not well regulated.

Case 3: Power in Partnership—Freedom Radio, WAMAC, and leveraging local radio to drive action on stolen funds at Aliko Dangote University of Science and Technology

Context and Background. Aliko Dangote University of Science and Technology (ADUSTECH), formerly known as Kano University of Science and Technology, Wudil (KUST), is a public university in Wudil, Kano state. ADUSTECH was rumored to have issues with paying staff, water scarcity, poor sanitation, and missing equipment. A journalist from Freedom Radio, a subgrantee and partner of On Nigeria grantee Wadata Media and Advocacy Center (WAMAC), attempted to ask the university's Vice Chancellor about these problems but was unable to secure adequate answers. The journalist then began an investigation, including interviewing ADUSTECH students and staff.

Exhibit 4. Case Snapshot: Power in Partnership—Freedom Radio, WAMAC, and leveraging local radio to drive action on stolen funds at Aliko Dangote University of Science and Technology

Grantee/subgrantee: Wadata Media and Advocacy Center/Freedom Radio





Issue: Aliko Dangote University of Science and Technology (ADUSTECH) (formerly KUST) had monetary and management issues resulting in poorly kept facilities and unpaid staff. An investigation by Freedom Radio uncovered the alleged theft of funds by the university's Vice Chancellor.

Activities: Freedom Radio journalists worked closely with the Academic Staff Union of Universities (ASUU) to connect with staff, students, and lecturers at the university to investigate the disappearance of funds. Freedom Radio broadcast its reporting widely. The story was also rebroadcast on several other local radio stations, and Freedom Radio hosted a townhall on the subject with local CSOs.



ACTORS REPRESENTED

- **Freedom Radio:** Freedom Radio was the first private radio station in northern Nigeria with the largest audience in the area. Freedom Radio conducted the investigation and broadcast the story on their station.
- Wadata Media and Advocacy Center (WAMAC): WAMAC is an On Nigeria grantee that
 partners with local radio stations around the country to support and build their capacity in
 investigative reporting. WAMAC has partnered with Freedom Radio and supported the
 investigation.
- Other local radio stations like **Solar Space, Radio Rahama, and Express Radio** rebroadcast the story, including translating it from Hausa to English.
- Academic Staff Union of Universities (ASUU): The ASUU is the union for academic staff of
 universities in Nigeria. In part due to their being directly affected by the stolen funds, they
 worked with Freedom Radio journalists to support their investigation and connect them to
 sources for interviews.

Investigative reporting process. Freedom Radio journalists contacted the ASUU. ASUU's chair was a source and an intermediary, connecting Freedom Radio to teachers/lecturers, the university's Vice Chancellor, and the students' union leaders for additional interviews. The investigation eventually revealed that the Vice Chancellor had allegedly stolen 352 million naira from staff pensions, eight cars worth over 200 million naira, and funds intended for library and hostel maintenance.

Amplification process. According to one of the respondents, Freedom Radio has a large audience in northern Nigeria and beyond. Because they are a trusted news source with many listeners and social media followers, this story spread quickly once broadcast. The story was amplified through rebroadcast on seven other stations, live interviews alongside updates on the story, and a townhall that Freedom Radio conducted with CSOs.

Action. In response to Freedom Radio's reporting, the now-former governor of Kano state convened a visitation panel for initial inquiries into the allegations at ADUSTECH. The panel produced a report, after which—as the report recommended—the governor constituted a formal investigative panel. Despite these initial steps, the investigative panel never began work, and few, if any, of the report's other recommendations, which included sanctions against the Vice Chancellor, were implemented. One respondent alleged that the former governor was receiving payoffs from the former Vice Chancellor, possibly influencing this inaction.

Results Achieved. Despite the lack of a formal investigation, one respondent believes that Freedom Radio's reporting did make an impression on the new university administration. The new Vice Chancellor at ADUSTECH took office in January 2023 and has committed to remedying these issues in a seven-point plan for improving the university.

Findings

Cross-case findings are presented along several lines of inquiry, each of which explores different aspects of the learning questions these case studies sought to interrogate.

Progress toward outcomes in the On Nigeria strategy-level and Media and Journalism theories of change

1

Respondents report that their work with affected communities during the investigative reporting and amplification process has improved corruption and human rights abuse awareness and engagement in target communities.

Grantees' efforts in all three cases appear to have contributed to improved citizens' awareness and capacity to act on corruption and human rights issues. For example, in Case 2 (Ogun State quarries), respondents explained that TheCable's investigation and PRIMORG's amplification work raised awareness about human rights violations in the quarries with the use of interactive radio programming where listeners can call in and join the discussion with experts and duty bearers that are especially useful in this regard.

There is this awareness on the part of citizens who listened into the program that issues of this nature is prevalent in as much as we focused in Ogun State. So, on the part of awareness on citizens, it is there, and for those who called in to say it is also happening in other quarry sites in Abuja and in other states. —Grantee KII 01

As a result, the National Union of Mine Workers got the leverage they needed to better engage the government on the working conditions and cases of human rights violations of workers. In Case 1 (Knifar Women), one respondent noted that building the capacity of several women in the Knifar movement to conduct reporting on their own stories has enabled the movement to conduct their own interviews and demand accountability. Finally, in Case 3 (ADUSTECH), respondents believe that Freedom Radio's work has improved university staff and student engagement with media around corruption issues and given them more tools to hold the university administration to account. Despite these improvements, respondents consistently noted that gaps remain in citizens' awareness of their rights and understanding of how to report and take action on abuses. They noted that citizens unaware of redress mechanisms and complaint channels may be unwilling or less likely to report when they are victims of corruption.

2

Investigative reporting and amplification efforts appear to have contributed to preliminary responses by government officials. However, these efforts have not yet resulted in actions against perpetrators of corruption or changes in policies or practices to prevent future corruption.

Respondents feel that, across all three cases, government actors have responded to allegations of corruption or human rights abuses. For example, in Case 1, a respondent noted that their ongoing reporting and amplification efforts over several years contributed to the release of illegally detained men in Borno State. Regarding Case 2, the NHRC's participation in PRIMORG's radio program, combined with PRIMORG's submission of victim complaints, encouraged government officials to launch an investigation into labor abuses and eventually impose light sanctions on at least some

quarries in Ogun State, with some workers also receiving needed PPE. In Case 3, Freedom Radio's reporting—because they are a trusted news outlet with a wide audience—led to widespread rebroadcasting of, and reactions to, their investigation into allegations of corruption at ADUSTECH. The former governor of Kano state convened a panel to review the investigations, which issued a report with recommendations for further action. Though these actions were not taken, the new ADUSTECH administration has committed to reforms. Exhibit 5 maps signs of progress in these cases to outcomes in the Media and Journalism theory of change (TOC).

...what we expect is a lot of transparency by the government such that if somebody is arrested, you can track the arrest, you can track the detention, you can confirm the status of the person, and you can track the progress with which the person's case is being treated; whether they are being interrogated or whether they have set a trial date...—Grantee KII 04

There is no evidence, however, of any of the individuals or companies involved in these abuses being prosecuted or held to account. Respondents believe that, to attain more substantive changes in checking corruption, the government needs to be more transparent. This would entail releasing information to track arrests, detainees, and their cases.

Exhibit 5. Summary of progress toward On Nigeria 2.0 Media and Journalism TOC outcomes

Level of Media and Journalism TOC	Progress toward Media and Journalism TOC outcomes
Root – Skill Building	Knifar women trained in investigative journalism/interviewing. (MJ2, MJ3) WAMAC supported a local radio station partner in investigating financial management at ADUSTECH. (MJ2)
Root – Collaboration	Stakeholders received policy briefs and combined complaints. (MJ4) Academics participated in a call-in radio program that citizens can participate in. (MJ4) CSOs attended a townhall to hear about the investigation. (MJ4)
Trunk – Voice, Gender Equality and Social Inclusion	HumAngle collaborates with the Knifar women to report on their issues in the IDP camps. (MJ7)
Trunk – Voice	HumAngle collaborated with Premium Times and other online news organizations, as well as a local station in the Lake Chad region, to syndicate their reports and podcasts. (MJ8) TheCable and PRIMORG collaborated on amplifying the investigation into labor abuses at a quarry in Ogun State through an interactive radio show. (MJ8) Freedom Radio collaborated with local radio stations to syndicate their investigation in other languages. (MJ8)
Branch – Prosecution	In response to reporting by HumAngle, the Nigerian army released the largest number of detained men to date. (MJ9) In response to reporting by TheCable, NHRC investigated labor abuses at Chinese-run quarries, and the government meted out some sanctions to such quarries. (MJ9) In response to reporting by Freedom Radio, the former governor of Kano State convened a visitation panel, published a report, and constituted an investigative panel into the financial management at ADUSTECH. (MJ9)
Branch – Rejection	HumAngle reports on all successes related to the Knifar women and their husbands' detention and release. (MJ10) Due to TheCable's investigation, a lawyer reviewed employment letters for several employees of Ding Xing quarry and advised them on their labor rights. (MJ10)

There are signs that investigative reporting and amplification efforts are contributing to improvements in citizens' awareness of, and capacity to use, accountability mechanisms, but questions about sustainability remain.

Each of these cases reportedly contributes to emerging accountability outcomes in two areas, both of which suggest signs of progress toward key outcomes in the On Nigeria strategy level TOC: growth in citizen awareness of corruption and accountability mechanisms (Outcome Strat. 2) and improved capacity of disadvantaged groups to advocate for their self-interest (Outcome Strat. 3).⁴ Exhibit 6 showcases examples of such progress.

Exhibit 6. Emerging accountability outcomes

GROWTH IN CITIZEN AWARENESS OF CORRUPTION AND ACCOUNTABILITY MECHANISMS

Caller: "My name is [name]. I'm calling from Abuja. Thank you for the guests talking. There is something going on inside [Abuja?] like some of those multinational companies. You don't need to go far. Please just send your investigation team..."

[Radio Transcript]

3

Host 1: "And remember that the program is interactive. The WhatsApp phone line to send your message to is [number]. How would you react to the conversation? We would like you to share your experience..."

[Radio Transcript]

"So, there is this awareness on the part of workers because the lawyer helped them to review their employment letters and all of that, so I would say yes, there is a bit of change."

[Grantee KII 01]

IMPROVED CAPACITY OF DISADVANTAGED GROUPS TO ADVOCATE FOR THEIR SELF-INTEREST

"Yes, there is a change towards the perception in the media especially by the university workers...They understand that the media is for everybody. What we are after is good governance and advocating the right things to do by everybody."

[Grantee KII 07]

"We got them smartphones, we got them tripods, we taught them how to take videos and we told them how to look at the sign of sexual violence or somebody being raped. We taught them how to ask questions. Before we knew it, about ten of these women could carry their smartphones, put them on a tripod, set up an interview session, interview a victim of sexual violence, and then they will send us the story..."

[Grantee KII 03]

"I also know that the Nigerian Union of Mine Workers has been on the neck of many of these Chinese companies for a very long time... So, I feel that after the report, they were able to get that change that they had been clamoring for, for a very long time."

[Grantee KII 02]

⁴ STRAT.2 Nigerians are more aware of the harmful impacts of corruption, including disproportionate effects of corruption on marginalized groups.

STRAT.3 Nigerian citizens, civil society actors, and other non-state actors—including marginalized groups—advocate for transparency and accountability, use redress mechanisms to act against corruption, and demand public service.

However, respondents from all three cases are concerned about the sustainability of these results. In Case 2, one respondent reported that further investigations showed that the government is complicit in ongoing abuses at the quarries throughout Ogun State, allowing quarries without licenses to continue operating. In Case 3, a respondent alleged without providing evidence that the former Vice Chancellor of ADUSTECH bribed the former

To be candid, I do not think the changes can be permanent, and that is because even from my further findings, I discovered that the government also has a role in all the things that happened at some of these places. — Grantee KII 02

governor of Kano state, potentially slowing down government action.

We do not have that tradition; keeping issues on the burner; let us go on doing our stories, our discussions, our editorials and all what not, on it. This will help in keeping the people and even the government on their toes. That would have been better for the society.

—Grantee KII 07

To address these concerns, and improve sustainability, a respondent involved with Case 1 highlighted the importance of consistent, ongoing reporting over time, noting that international organizations such as Amnesty International often quickly move on to other conflicts. This makes it critical that media organizations stay with a story over several years, reporting on successes as they emerge. Respondents involved with Cases 2 and 3 generally agreed with this view, with one mentioning that

media, CSOs, and other amplifiers are often unable to keep a report on the front burner until all actions are taken. These organizations may also have planned goals and activities, keeping them from continuing to report on the same story.

Respondents from Cases 1 and 3 explained that financial constraints may restrict media organizations' ability to conduct this kind of ongoing reporting and hinder sustainability. Constraints included the difficulties of balancing work that brings in regular revenue with deep, costly investigations, and this constant balancing act sometimes limits the amount of coverage a news organization can devote to a single issue or story.

Media revenue is at its lowest, sustainability is at its lowest, and it is a problem. It is important, it is a conversation that we want to have, [and] it is a conversation that is important if at all what we are doing is important. —Grantee KII 03

Factors that facilitate and challenge investigative reporting and amplification results

4

Bringing together reform-minded stakeholders and partners across the media ecosystem to collaborate on strategic investigative reporting and amplification efforts facilitates and deepens engagement, supports dissemination, and generates pressure for action.

All three cases included in this report showcase how collaboration and partnerships, both formal and informal, facilitated investigative reporting and amplification that contributed to some level of

government response and action. While each collaborative effort is different, each contributed to successful investigations, amplification efforts, and/or subsequent changes (Exhibit 7).

Exhibit 7. Summary of Key Partnerships in each case

	Case 1: Humanitarian Journalism in Action	Case 2: Connecting Reporting to Engagement	Case 3: Power in Partnership
Investigation	Trusted relationships with leaders of the Knifar movement and a local translator led to open sharing from the women and introduction to additional women to share their stories.	Relationships with the truckers allowed the journalists inside the quarry, and building trust with the Nigerian Union of Mine Workers and employees of the quarry led them to share their stories openly.	WAMAC's partnership and granting build the capacity of journalists at Freedom Radio to conduct investigative reporting. Journalists build a trusting relationship with leaders of the ASUU, getting them their stories and connecting them to students and other staff to uncover further information.
Amplification	HumAngle worked with local radio stations to syndicate some of their podcast episodes as well as with other online media outlets to syndicate some of their reports.	A formal collaboration between PRIMORG and TheCable resulted in story amplification on the radio with the journalist, experts , and a representative from NHRC , leading to increased pressure on the NHRC and the government to act.	Other local radio stations helped by syndicating the investigative report on their channels, raising awareness of the issues across the state. Freedom Radio hosted a townhall with local CSOs to share the investigation findings.
Change/Action	Building the capacity of some Knifar women in investigative reporting continues the cycle of ongoing reporting on issues and demanding accountability. HumAngle leverages connections to various government stakeholders and shares policy briefs they have created to further demand accountability.	PRIMORG leverages connections to various government stakeholders to submit collated complaints on behalf of those who experience labor abuses at the quarry.	N/A

In all three cases, respondents reported that building trust with key stakeholders—the leaders of the Knifar movement, the Union of Mine Workers, the ASUU, and others—enabled them to obtain valuable sources, acquire information, and carry out their investigations. Repeated interactions help to build this trust over time.

I would say we all played important role. No single organisation did everything, yeah, so both...Cable [Newspaper Journalism] Foundation, PRIMORG, and National Human Rights Commission and then the victims also.

—Grantee KII 01

All ears are on our radio station because we are the first private radio in the northern part of Nigeria, so we have listeners there, across societies, across Nigeria, and beyond. Anything from our station, it is gotten by so many, because many people believe in that station. —Grantee KII 07

One reason for the success of our engagement is that we were able to build trust with the members of the group, and because we have built trust and credibility, we are also able to continue to get ...access to them as sources, as fixers, as reporters.

—Grantee KII 04

Trust can also be formed at the organizational level. Both PRIMORG and Freedom Radio have become reliable sources for their listeners, garnering a large audience and even encouraging listeners to reach out to the radio station to report corruption.

HumAngle also noted that competition among media houses, lack of collaboration caused by tension between civil society and media, and a lack of social cohesion among different groups in Nigeria posed challenges in their reporting, including a lack of sharing resources, a wariness of other sectors to collaborate with journalists, and ethnic profiling. Respondents in Cases 1 and 2 reported that achieving stronger results in the future will require more commitment by CSOs to using investigative reporting data to advocate for reform.

5

Respondents noted that despite being distressed by corruption, public officials and citizens are sometimes unwilling to support or engage with anticorruption reporting.

Respondents in all cases identified factors that limit officials' and citizens' willingness to engage with and/or act on anticorruption or human rights reporting (Exhibit 8).

Exhibit 8. Identified barriers to public official and citizen action on corruption

	Public Officials	Citizens
Case 1: Humanitarian Journalism in Action: HumAngle's work with the Knifar Movement	Lack of government transparency.	Lack of social cohesion, which can lead to apathy toward different groups or ethnic profiling.
Case 2: Connecting Reporting to Engagement: TheCable, PRIMORG, and data- driven collaboration to amplify and address labor abuses in Ogun State	Budgetary constraints which limit the ability to reach victims of abuse/corruption. Other inability or unwillingness to conduct their mandated actions.	Perception that cases are not taken up by any government agency, and if they are, nothing happens. Unwillingness of victims to speak out due to the perception that nothing would come of it. Apathy of victims due to the struggle to survive, causing the investigation to seem like a distraction.
Case 3: Power in Partnership—Freedom Radio, WAMAC, and leveraging local radio to drive action on stolen funds at Aliko Dangote University of Science and Technology (ADUSTECH)	Alleged payoffs to public officials to not act.	Fear or the perception that they cannot do anything to solve the issues.

These factors have consequences. For example, regarding Case 2, the NHRC was reportedly unable to fund a robust investigation, while mine workers were unable to travel to the NHRC offices, and some saw the investigation as a distraction from their daily struggle to provide for their families resulting in a less robust investigation and subsequent lack of evidence for stronger sanctions or policy change at regulatory government offices. In Case 3, one respondent lamented that despite many complaints, many Nigerian people fail to act in response to corruption because of fear or the perception that,

despite their efforts, nothing would be done, which can lead to a lack of cooperation with the media and lower quality investigative reporting. In Case 1, the Knifar women are far removed both geographically and ethnically from many other parts of Nigeria, making it easy for people to ignore their plight. One respondent described how this distance can lead to apathy or ethnic profiling from other Nigerians, making it more difficult to get the necessary attention needed to prompt change.

I think we do not understand our diversity. So, there is a problem of diversity, there is fragmentation, there is lack of social cohesion. So, this has also affected even the solutions to those problems. So, the Knifar women; are they even among the category of people that should make the news? No! — Grantee KII 03

In addition to these barriers, respondents also mentioned that several safety risks impeded investigations. *Accessing dangerous areas* remains a persistent issue for journalists across Nigeria. In

of the army's

So, I think for us, it was really difficult for us to define the lines between humanitarian work and humanitarian reporting where your source sees you as a helper, not knowing that you are just there to tell a story. So, that is also a major problem, and without the sources, that is always difficult to navigate. —Grantee KII 03

Case 1, the Knifar women were located in insecure areas outside of Maiduguri and elsewhere in Borno State. In Case 2, getting access to the quarry that was the subject of the report was dangerous for the reporter. *Threats from those complicit in corruption* also hindered investigations. A journalist involved with Case 3 was robbed and told he was unwelcome on ADUSTECH grounds, while HumAngle's CEO was accused of being a Boko Haram sympathizer after publishing articles critical

treatment of the Knifar women and their families. Many journalists also face *social, emotional, and mental risks* when they engage in investigative reporting, as many of those they speak with live in perilous circumstances. According to one respondent, it can be difficult to distinguish humanitarian reporting from humanitarian work, which can cause journalists distress.

Nigerians, especially in this part of the country are afraid. I do not know. Is it fear or something? Somebody is suffering and the person behind the suffering is there, he is seeing him physically and he cannot do something to stop it. This is the most terrible thing about our people. —Grantee KII 07

Conclusions

Conclusion 1: The evidence in these cases suggests that grantees' approaches to investigative reporting and amplification have improved citizens' awareness of corruption and abuses in local contexts, supported broader participation in efforts to pressure government actors to take action, and contributed to modest improvements in the conditions of those affected by exploitation.

The grantees involved in these cases—in collaboration with partners—are using a number of strategies that appear to improve the quality of investigative reporting efforts. These strategies include building trust with historically disadvantaged groups and those affected by accountability failures and/or other abuses, elevating the perspectives of those most affected, collaborating with other media organizations to improve investigative reporting capacity and resourcing, and going undercover to conduct reporting in restricted areas. These reporting strategies, when combined with a range of amplification approaches like partnering with local radio stations to disseminate stories, sharing reports on multiple platforms including podcasts and social media, and publishing content in local languages to engage target audiences in the geographies affected by an issue, appear to have broadened and deepened local citizens' awareness of corruption issues in local contexts. In some cases, they may have also contributed to active engagement and participation in efforts to address identified issues.

Moreover, all three cases suggest that initial changes in transparency and participation may have played a role in forcing teeth actors to act on identified issues in ways that contributed to improvements in the situation of those affected. For example, the army released some of the husbands of women in the Knifar Movement, some conditions in the Ogun State quarries improved, and the new administration at ADUSTECH made a firm commitment to reform. These are real and important successes, especially given the extremely challenging contexts in which Media and Journalism grantees and their partners are working. They suggest signs of modest progress toward key outcomes in the On Nigeria strategy-level TOC—specifically, improvements in citizens' awareness of the harmful impacts of corruption (outcome STRAT 2) in particular contexts, as well as non-state actors and historically disadvantaged groups advocating for accountability (outcome STRAT 3). These cases also present evidence of some momentum toward outcomes throughout the Media and Journalism cohort-specific TOC, from improvements in quality, collaborative reporting on historically disadvantaged groups (outcomes MJ.2-4, MJ.6-8), and at least preliminary government responses to address specific issues (outcome MJ.9).

Conclusion 2: Despite preliminary signs of progress, sustained improvements in transparency remain limited in these cases, and full accountability for those accused of corruption and other abuses is lacking. These deficits have many causes, but citizen disaffection and resourcing challenges for media organizations are important factors.

The investigative reporting and amplification efforts presented in these cases have brought corruption and human rights abuses to the fore in local contexts but present limited evidence of those responsible for abuses actually being held to account. Several factors contribute to these ongoing accountability deficits. Many respondents in the cases spoke of citizens declining to support investigative reporting efforts, much less being willing to raise their voices to hold alleged abusers to account due to fear of reprisals, the simple struggle to survive, and/or doubt that change is even possible. In addition, those conducting investigative reporting sometimes lack the resources to build on and maintain ongoing, effective reporting and amplification efforts.

Together, these factors obstruct sustainable reporting, limit the durability of improvements in transparency, and hinder the potential of voice actors to take part in long-lasting actions against

corruption or other abuses. They also weaken the incentives for teeth actors to engage in robust reforms that might eventually lead to longer-term accountability. To sustain the preliminary signs of transparency emerging in these cases and strengthen accountability in the longer term, complementary actions to shift norms around corruption are needed.

Conclusion 3: Grantees and their partners involved in these change stories are leveraging collaborative investigative reporting and amplification efforts to seek improvements in sectors beyond the accountability ecosystem, including education and human rights.

These cases provide clear and compelling evidence of the fact that On Nigeria grantees, subgrantees, and their partners are reaching beyond the accountability ecosystem to support work that covers areas and sectors that are not strictly limited to corruption. Both HumAngle's work with the Knifar Movement in Borno State and CNJF's support for in-depth reporting on the conditions in quarries in Ogun State address serious human rights abuses, while WAMAC subgrantee Freedom Radio reported on corruption in the education sector. The work undertaken in these examples, therefore, indicates that some grantees and their partners are collaboratively pursuing results that go beyond preventing, rejecting, or prosecuting corruption. They are seeking to influence the broader sociopolitical system and context in Nigeria and contribute to some preliminary results as they do.